

FINAL REPORT

MEDICAL BOARD OF CALIFORNIA ENFORCEMENT PROGRAM MONITOR

Julianne D'Angelo Fellmeth

MBC Enforcement Program Monitor
Administrative Director/Supervising Attorney
Center for Public Interest Law
University of San Diego School of Law

Thomas A. Papageorge

Principal Consultant
Head Deputy District Attorney, Consumer Protection Division
Los Angeles District Attorney's Office

November 1, 2005

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<u>Chapter</u>	<u>Page</u>
Acknowledgments	iii
Executive Summary	ES-1
I. Introduction	1
II. Overview of the Medical Board of California	5
III. Summary of the <i>Initial Report of the MBC Enforcement Program Monitor</i>	11
IV. 2005 Reform Legislation Addressing the Monitor's Recommendations	17
V. MBC's Enforcement Program: General Description and Threshold Concerns	33
VI. Complaint Receipt and Screening: Central Complaint Unit	49
VII. Field Investigations: District Offices	79
VIII. Expert Reviewer Program	103
IX. Prosecutions: Health Quality Enforcement Section	109
X. Hearings: Medical Quality Hearing Panel	121
XI. Decisions: Division of Medical Quality	129
XII. Judicial Review of DMQ Decisions	145

XIII.	Public Disclosure	151
XIV.	Public Education and Outreach	157
XV.	MBC's Diversion Program	163
XVI.	Other Areas of Monitor Inquiry	189
XVII.	Conclusion and Recommendations for the Future	201

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The Medical Board Enforcement Monitor project, now concluded, was at all times a joint effort of many contributors, whom we gratefully acknowledge here.

First, neither the Enforcement Monitor project nor the fundamental reform legislation resulting from the project would exist but for the efforts of Senator Liz Figueroa, the longtime and dedicated chair of both the Senate Committee on Business, Professions and Economic Development and the Joint Committee on Boards, Commissions and Consumer Protection. Special thanks were earned by Joint Committee Chief Consultant Ed Howard, who spearheaded the negotiation of SB 231 (Figueroa). We also thank Senate Business and Professions Committee Chief Consultant Bill Gage, Joint Committee Consultant David Link, Assembly Business and Professions Committee Chief Consultant Jay Greenwood, and Assembly Business and Professions Committee Principal Consultant Ross Warren for their valuable input and assistance in the extraordinary legislative effort required to secure the passage of SB 231.

The Monitor is grateful to Governor Arnold Schwarzenegger for signing SB 231 (Figueroa), and to Charlene Zettel, Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs, for her support of the Monitor project.

The Monitor thanks the current members of the Medical Board — led by 2004–05 President Mitch Karlan, M.D., and 2005–06 President Ron Wender, M.D. — for their leadership and unwavering support for the vast majority of the Monitor’s recommendations. Dr. Wender’s presence and testimony at all the legislative hearings on SB 231 demonstrate his firm commitment to improving the Medical Board’s enforcement program. The Monitor is grateful to the many past Medical Board presidents who spoke out in strong support of SB 231 and its vertical prosecution goal — including 1993–94 President Bruce Hasenkamp, J.D.; 1994–95 President Robert del Junco, M.D.; 1995–96 President Alan Shumacher, M.D.; 1996–97 President Stewart Hsieh, J.D.; 1997–99 President Tom Joas, M.D.; 1999–2000 President Karen McElliott; and 2000–01 President Ira Lubell, M.D. Additionally, the Monitor thanks former MBC Executive Director Dixon Arnett and former Department of Consumer Affairs Director Jim Conran for supporting the bill and its reforms.

In researching and writing both reports, the Monitor was greeted with full and complete cooperation from management and staff across the state at both the Medical Board of California and the Health Quality Enforcement Section of the Attorney General’s Office. At the Medical Board, we are especially thankful to Executive Director Dave Thornton, Deputy Executive Director Kim Kirchmeyer, and Enforcement Chief Joan Jerzak for their long careers in public service and for their candor and receptiveness toward this project. We similarly acknowledge Senior Assistant Attorney General Carlos Ramirez and the many fine attorneys at the Health Quality Enforcement Section. We owe special thanks in advance to Dave Thornton, Joan Jerzak, and Carlos Ramirez for leading their respective troops toward full and successful implementation of the vertical prosecution model. As stated by the Federation of State Medical Boards in its support letter on SB 231, “the Federation is eager to follow how this early coordination and close partnership between attorneys and investigators is realized as it may create a model for other licensing boards to follow.” MBC and HQE are in the hands of dedicated public servants who are making a daily commitment to bettering the Board’s enforcement program on behalf of all Californians. We salute them all.

We are grateful to former University of San Diego School of Law Dean Daniel B. Rodriguez, Interim Dean Kevin Cole, and Los Angeles County District Attorney Steve Cooley for permitting us to undertake this important project along with the demands of our permanent posts.

Although this report is written primarily by us, it is based upon the invaluable research and other work conducted by other members of the Monitor’s team. Ben Frank, Director of the NewPoint Group in Sacramento, performed all data-gathering and analysis and the extensive and insightful business process analysis of the Diversion Program. Ben’s statistical analyses and agency insights are featured prominently in both the *Initial Report* and the *Final Report*, and we thank him for contributing his experience and skills to this project. We thank Hanna Gibson, third-year law student at the University of San Diego School of Law, for her meticulous proofreading, cite-checking, and editing of the *Final Report*. Once again, Elisa Weichel of the Children’s Advocacy Institute took our raw work, performed her usual magic, and turned it into something fit to print on paper and online. And we are grateful to Professor Robert C. Fellmeth — Price Professor in Public Interest Law at the University of San Diego School of Law, former State Bar Discipline Monitor, and primary author of *Physician Discipline in California: A Code Blue Emergency* — for pioneering the “enforcement monitor” concept and for his extraordinary contributions to the fields of administrative law, public interest advocacy, and professional discipline.

Finally, on a personal note, the Monitor once again extends her deepest thanks to Sol and Helen Price, who have generously endowed the Center for Public Interest Law at the University of San Diego School of Law. Without them, CPIL would not exist.

Julianne D’Angelo Fellmeth
Thomas A. Papageorge

© Copyright 2005 by the Center for Public Interest Law
University of San Diego School of Law
5998 Alcalá Park ■ San Diego, CA 92110
(619) 260-4806 ■ Fax: (619) 260-4753
www.cpil.org